Draft Endline Enterprise Survey Protocols

|  |
| --- |
| April 16, 2018  The following is a draft set of protocols to be reviewed by the subcontractor. Suggested revisions should be made directly into the document in track-changes. After discussion, the protocols will be finalized, translated by the subcontractor, taught as part of training, and disseminated in manuals to all personnel. |

Contents

[1.1 Outreach protocol 2](#_Toc517818271)

[1.1.1 Outreach tracking 2](#_Toc517818272)

[1.1.2 Outreach and internal replacement 2](#_Toc517818273)

[1.2 Notes on the instrument 4](#_Toc517818274)

[1.3 Human subjects protection 4](#_Toc517818275)

[1.3.1 Informed consent 4](#_Toc517818276)

[1.3.2 Personnel NDA 5](#_Toc517818277)

[1.3.3 Data security 6](#_Toc517818278)

[1.4 Supervision and quality control 7](#_Toc517818279)

[1.4.1 Daily debriefs 7](#_Toc517818280)

[1.4.2 Supervisor checks 7](#_Toc517818281)

[1.4.3 Accompaniments 7](#_Toc517818282)

[1.4.4 Backcheck protocol 7](#_Toc517818283)

[1.5 Dissemination of results 10](#_Toc517818284)

[1.6 Frequently asked questions and suggested responses 10](#_Toc517818285)

## Attrition Minimization, Outreach and Replacement Protocol

### Sampling

This is a panel survey, and the sample for the endline will be the same as the baseline and will be provided by SI

### Attrition minimization:

While some attrition between baseline and endline is inevitable, SI and the subcontractor will develop and apply a series of protocols to reduce attrition as much as possible within reasonable budget and time constraints. Excessive attrition will undermine the validity of the study. As such, we have targeted a 10% attrition rate. The subcontractor should track attrition and protocols should be revisited if attrition rates appear greater than 10%. For now we assume the following:

1. **If baseline respondent is on vacation, sick leave, or not available**: The subcontractor should arrange a time at a later date to conduct the interview. If this requires a greater than two weeks wait AND would entail excessive costs to return to the location, then the interview could be done with another suitable respondent (MD/CEO/owner) or over the phone. These cases should be tracked and recorded.
2. **If the baseline respondent does not want to participate:** The matter should be referred to a supervisor who should attempt to convince the individual in-person. At the end of the day, however, the survey is voluntary and if after reasonable pushback the respondent does not want to participate, then this should be noted as a refusal.

### Outreach

The goal of outreach is to conduct an endline survey with all baseline firms. Some attrition is inevitable as businesses fail; however, outreach should be done in such a way so as to minimize attrition. This requires (1) careful tracking of outreach efforts, (2) courtesy and respectful outreach, (3) extensive efforts to track down respondents, firms, or find replacements from within the firm, and (4) the involvement of supervisors (escalation) when it appears that a respondent or firm is not cooperating. Firms will not be replaced; however, individual respondents within the firm should be replaced if the original respondent is not available or refuses to participate.

### Outreach tracking

1. Establish an electronic database of all respondents with at least the following fields:
   1. From the dataset: Unique id, firm name, respondent(s) name(s), position title, position category, cellphone(s), work phones, address information, GIS coordinates, and others deemed useful.
   2. New fields: Follow-up attempt status, comments on follow-up, flag for supervisor escalation, final status (non-contact, refusal, completed), reason for non-contact (business failed, incorrect information), reason for refusal (TBD), and respondent (change in respondent, original respondent).
2. Update the database throughout data collection.
3. Submit a final completed tracking database upon completion of the survey.

### Outreach and internal replacement

1. To minimize attrition, extensive outreach should include (a) multiple contact efforts, (b) efforts to identify alternative respondents if original respondents are unavailable, (c) efforts to speak with the MD/CEO/Owner, (d) physical visits to the location, and (e) escalation to a supervisor.
2. Reach out via phone using first personal cellphone devices to the wave 1 respondent

*Hello my name is \_\_\_ and I am calling on behalf of the evaluation and research firms, Social Impact and XXXX. In 2015 or 2016 your firm participated in a survey with businesses registered to sell goods and services to the government. This study was contracted by the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC) of the United States as part of an evaluation of its work in Malawi.*

*We first and foremost want to thank you for your participation. If you are interested, we can share with you a short summary of the results via email or WhatsApp. Second, we are calling to follow-up with firms and conduct the survey again to see how things have changed or stayed the same since we last conducted the survey. The survey should take approximately 45 minutes. Your continued participation is very important to us. I’m calling to schedule an appointment for one of my colleagues to conduct an interview. What day and time would be good for you?*

* 1. If yes: Proceed to schedule an appointment. Confirm location information and obtain directions.
  2. If busy and they ask to call back. Due so up to four times. Then a physical visit will be needed.
  3. If they say they do not want to participate

*I’m sorry to hear that. We really appreciate that you were willing to speak with us at baseline. The study was able to document the power related challenges that businesses face in Malawi. For example, we were able to produce estimates of the costs of outages and low voltages. This kind of research is important to help generate improvements in the power sector. I would be grateful if you would reconsider.*

If the answer is still no. Thank them for their time and escalate to a supervisor. The supervisor should call back or preferably stop by the location at a later date. Reemphasize the importance and see if there is another person that would be able to do the interview.

* 1. If no longer with the company: See #5 below.

1. If the respondent cannot be reached on his/her cellphone, attempt to contact the respondent through the company telephone number.

*Hello my name is \_\_\_ and I am calling on behalf of the evaluation and research firms, Social Impact and Espiralica. I’m trying to reach \_\_\_\_\_\_\_, is he or she available?*

* 1. If the respondent is not available, then leave a message. If the phone call is not returned within the next day, then call again. At least four attempts should be made over the course of two weeks. After that a physical visit will be required.
  2. If this is not successful, the supervisor should attempt to call and request to speak with the MD, CEO, or owners depending on the nature of the firm. If it appears unlikely that the respondent will be reached, then ask to speak with another representative. (See point 5)

1. If the company telephone number does not work, try to identify the number another way (e.g., phone directories, chamber of commerce).
2. If a correct number cannot be identified, the company should be visited in person. GIS data should be used to locate companies and the company should map locations.
3. If the company can be reached but the wave 1 respondent (1) is no longer with the company or (2) is unavailable for the foreseeable future, then request to speak to another respondent.

*That is too bad that we will not be able to speak with \_\_\_\_\_\_. Perhaps you can help me. In 2015 or 2016 \_\_\_\_\_\_ participated in a survey with businesses about power related issues. This study was contracted by the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC) of the United States as part of an evaluation of its work in Malawi. We are calling to follow-up with firms and repeat the survey to see how things have or have not changed. Since we won’t be able to speak with \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_, is there another person with primary responsibility for government procurements that we could speak with?*

* 1. If this is not successful, the supervisor should attempt to call and request to speak with the MD, CEO, or owner depending on the nature of the firm.

1. If extensive efforts have been made, including (a) multiple contact efforts, (b) efforts to identify alternative respondents, (c) efforts to speak with the MD/CEO/Owner, (d) physical visits to the location, and (e) escalation to a supervisor, then update the Outreach tracking data accordingly to non-contact or refusal and update the reason for non-contact (business failed, incorrect information), reason for refusal (TBD), and respondent (change in respondent, original respondent)

### Firm Replacement

If a firm needs to be dropped from the study, then it should be replaced using ESCOM customer rolls. The final sample sizes should be the same at endline and baseline. The replacement firm should (1) have the same type of connection, (2) be from the same geographical area, and (3) have a comparable level of electricity consumption. This can all be determined from ESCOM customer data. Ideally, the replacement firm would be from (4) the same industry (e.g., maize mill, non-agriculture manufacturing); however, they might not here be clear from the customer rolls. The subcontractor may propose other means to determine industry.

The subcontractor should develop a means to randomly select replacements from ESCOM customer rolls. This should entail (1) identifying firms that meet the criteria above, (2) assigning each a random number and rank ordering these, and (3) selecting the first firm that is not already in the sample. The subcontractor should provide SI with a list of refusals and replacements along with corresponding randomization code as part of the bi-weekly reporting. The details of this approach should be proposed by the subcontractor and approved by SI prior to application.

## Notes on the instrument

(TBD subcontractor to develop based on salient points)

## Human subjects protection protocol

Protecting the confidentiality of information provided by study participants is one of highest concerns. If information is not kept in confidence it could compromise the enterprise’s relationship with ESCOM. As such, (1) all study participants must provide informed consent, (2) research team members must sign and uphold a non-disclosure and ethical data collection document, and (3) confidential information must only be shared through secure means.

### Informed consent

(See instrument)

### Personnel NDA

**MCC Honduras Country Threshold Program Evaluation**

**Respondent Protection, Data Security, Ethical Conduct**

**Non-Disclosure Agreement (NDA) Form**

All data collectors, supervisors, managers, and others involved in this evaluation are required to adhere to Social Impact, Inc.’s (SI) guidelines on data security and protection of Personally Identifiable Information (PII) throughout all evaluation tasks. This policy states that as a representative of **Espirálica**, you are responsible for working to proactively protect PII within the scope of the evaluation.

Evaluation personnel selected may not be below 18 years of age. All evaluation personnel are responsible to abide by the principles communicated during the ethics training. This includes the informed consent process that is required before each interview. Consent must be obtained or else an interview cannot be conducted. This also includes the requirement to keep all information confidential—whether it is information stored electronically, on paper, or on the mind.

All contractor employees or independent contractors engaged in this contract shall provide a non-disclosure agreement as follows signed by the individual contractor/consultant and, if a contractor employee, by the contractor’s contract administrator:

**NON-DISCLOSURE AGREEMENT**

I, \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ do solemnly swear (or affirm) that I will not divulge any information, whether obtained orally or in writing from, or data maintained through the MCC Compact Program Evaluation to any unauthorized person for any purpose. I will not directly or indirectly use, or allow the use of Confidential Information for any other purpose other than that directly associated with my officially assigned duties for the MCC Malawi Contract.

Further, I will not directly or indirectly reveal or cause to be revealed the nature or content of any (Confidential Information), except to authorized personnel. Specifically, I confirm that:

\_\_\_\_\_ I will not conduct interviews with individuals under 18 years of age

\_\_\_\_\_ I will always obtain prior informed consent before interviewing any respondent

\_\_\_\_\_ I will be vigilant to prevent excess risks to participants in this study

\_\_\_\_\_ I will keep all personal information I gather confidential

\_\_\_\_\_ I will not divulge any passwords to someone outside the evaluation team

\_\_\_\_\_ I will immediately report to my superior any suspected instance of breach of

confidentiality or privacy of respondent data

\_\_\_\_\_ I will immediately report to my superior any instance of unethical behavior I observe

by others participating in this study

\_\_\_\_\_ I will ask my superior for guidance in any scenario in which my actions or the actions of others participating in data collection may endanger the confidentiality or privacy of respondent data

\_\_\_\_\_ I will not use any materials provided for purposes other than data collection

\_\_\_\_\_ If any materials I am given are lost or stolen I will immediately report it to my manager

\_\_\_\_\_ I will never fabricate data or misrepresent data for any reason

I am aware that the unauthorized use of information may be a violation of law and this Agreement.

Company or Subcontractor

Understand that authorized persons refer only to persons assigned to a project requiring access to Confidential Information or directly in the line of management over the project requiring access to the data.

Printed Name: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

### Data security

Data that includes personal and identifiable data (PII)[[1]](#footnote-2) should be encrypted using Advanced Encryption Standard 256 prior to sharing via electronic means. This is done automatically through the Survey CTO software. There should not be a need to transmit PII data over email; however, if there is it should be done using a secure method. There are a variety of encryption methods and software available; however, we recommend using 7zip, which requires a free download for those sharing and receiving files.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Recommended program | **7zip**; requires free download, accessible [here](http://www.7-zip.org/download.html) |
| How it works | Single files or groups of files are copied into an “archive” which is encrypted with a password set by the user. Recipients need to use that password to decrypt the archive and access the files. The original files remain in their original location and are not encrypted. |
| Passwords | Create a strong password that contains at least 10 characters, and is a combination of numbers 1234567890, symbols (such as !@#$%^&\*\_) and UPPER case and lower case letters. There is no password recovery feature. If it is lost, the archive cannot be decrypted. Data collection firms should document the password in a project folder where only authorized personnel have access to it. |
| Password sharing | After sharing the file with intended recipients, passwords should be shared via a different mode of communication (e.g. Skype, WhatsApp, separate email). Keep in mind the limitations about each method. If the password is simply shared in a different email, and someone unauthorized gets access to the email account, s/he will have access to both the file and the password. If there is no other feasible way to share the password other than a separate email to the intended recipient(s), it is important that the email with the password is not labeled such that it is obvious what the password is for. WhatsApp is end-to-end encrypted so messages are secure from the point of view of transfer over wireless networks, etc., but people with access to the devices and/or WhatsApp apps on the devices will have access to the password. |
| Reducing chances of data loss | 7zip is the recommended program since the archive is encrypted, rather than the original files, which remain where they were and not encrypted. Users should NOT delete original files once the encrypted archive is created, in order to maintain the original copies and reduce the chances of data loss. |
| Alternative options | If, for some reason, 7zip does not appear to be a feasible option, please consult SI. |

## ENCRYPT AND DECRYPT FILES USING 7ZIP

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ***To encrypt:***   1. **Right click files** 2. **7zip…** 3. **Add to Archive…** 4. **choose “.zip”** 5. **enter password** 6. **choose “AES-256” encryption** 7. **OK** 8. **Zipped file can be emailed** | ***To decrypt:***   1. **Right click on folder** 2. **7zip…** 3. **Extract files…** 4. **Enter password** 5. **OK** |

## Supervision and quality control protocol

(Subcontractor to fill out details of daily debriefs, supervisor checks, and accompaniment)

### Daily debriefs

### Supervisor checks

### Accompaniments

### Co-enumeration

### Backcheck protocol

To check for compliance with protocols, accuracy of the data, and professionalism it will be important to conduct backchecks.

* Distribution
  + 10% of survey respondents, stratified by institution, should undergo a backcheck. This means 106 firms must complete a full back check.
* Timing
  + 50% of the backchecks should be completed by the end of the 2nd week of data collection. This will allow for any corrective action to be made early in the data collection process.
* Selection
  + Half of the backchecks respondents should be selected purposively based on red flags that arise during data collection. This might be based on high frequency checks by SI, concerns with enumerators, interviews with short durations, etc…
  + The remaining half should be selected randomly.
  + The subcontractor will be responsible for selection with SI input.
* Reporting
  + The Subcontractor should use the Bi-Weekly Reports to update SI on backcheck progress, findings and corrective actions
* Responsibilities
  + Backchecks should not be done by supervisors directly overseeing enumerators. These should be done by other supervisors, field coordinators, or a team established for this purpose.
* Instrument
  + The draft backcheck instrument for comment is as follows:

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Question number** | **Question** | **No.** | **Response options** | **Note** |
|  | Section Y: Preliminary section to be done off Survey CTO |  |  |  |
| Y1 | Hello, my name is \_\_\_ and I’m calling from XXX. I’m trying to reach \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_. Is he/she available? |  |  |  |
|  |  | 1 | Yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | No |  |
|  |  | 3 | Incorrect number |  |
| Y2 | You are receiving this call because you recently participated in a survey about electricity issues and challenges. We conduct a very short follow-up call with a small percentage of respondents to see how the survey went and ensure that it is being carried out as planned. Did you participate in such as survey? |  |  |  |
|  |  | 1 | Yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | No |  |
| Y3 | Our records indicate that a researcher by the name of XXX came to your office on XXXX and conducted an interview with you. It took X time and entailed questions about your businesses response to outages, interactions with ESCOM. Are you sure that you did not participate in such a survey? |  |  | Y2=2. If No, thank the respondent, end the survey, and refer to investigation. |
|  |  | 1 | Yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | No |  |
| Y4 | Would you mind if I ask you just a few quick questions? It should just take a few minutes |  |  | Y2=1 |
|  |  | 1 | Yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | No |  |
| Y5 | Can I call you back later? |  |  | Y4=2. If no, politely try again. If the answer is no, then record A3 response for that firm and move on to another respondent. |
|  |  | 1 | Yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | No |  |
| Y6 | When would be a good time? (Date) |  |  | Y5=1 |
|  |  |  | Number |  |
| Y7 | (Time) |  |  | Constraint 1-23:0-59 |
|  |  |  | Number |  |
|  | Section Z: Backcheck to be done on Survey CTO |  |  |  |
| z1 | Thank you. Before starting the survey, the interviewer should have done a few of things. I want to ask you if he or she did each one. First, did he or she inform you that the survey was voluntary? |  |  |  |
|  |  | 1 | Yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | No |  |
| Z2 | Did he or she ask if you were willing to participate in the survey? |  |  |  |
|  |  | 1 | Yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | No |  |
| Z3 | How would you evaluate the treatment by the interviewee? |  |  |  |
|  |  | 1 | Very good |  |
|  |  | 2 | Good |  |
|  |  | 3 | Fair |  |
|  |  | 4 | Poor |  |
|  |  | 5 | Very poor |  |
| Z4 | I’m sorry to hear that the treatment was not good. Could you tell me what was not good or what could have been better? |  |  | Z3=3 | 4 | 5 |
|  |  |  | Text |  |
| Z5 | I would like to repeat a couple of question from the survey to ensure your answer was properly recorded: At the time of the survey (XXXXX), did you own or use a generator? |  |  | Import date |
|  |  | 1 | yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | no |  |
|  |  | -97 | N/A |  |
|  |  | -98 | Don't know |  |
|  |  | -99 | Refuse/don't want to answer |  |
| Z6 | Had your company solicited a new electricity connection within the 12 months prior to the survey (XXXX). |  |  | Import date |
|  |  | 1 | yes |  |
|  |  | 2 | no |  |
|  |  | -97 | N/A |  |
|  |  | -98 | Don't know |  |
|  |  | -99 | Refuse/don't want to answer |  |
| Z7 | The survey asked some sensitive questions about things like corruption. Did you feel like you could answer these questions honestly? |  |  |  |
|  |  | 1 | Completely honestly |  |
|  |  | 2 | Mostly honestly |  |
|  |  | 3 | Somewhat honestly |  |
|  |  | 4 | Not very honestly |  |
|  |  | 5 | Not at all honestly |  |
| Z8 | Why did you feel like you couldn’t be completely honest? |  |  | Z7= 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|  |  |  | Text |  |
| Z9 | Is there any other feedback that you would like to provide to us? |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Text |  |
|  | Thank you for your time and for participating in the survey. |  |  |  |
|  | Section AA: To be filled in by backchecker after a completed backcheck |  |  |  |
| AA1 | Unique ID from the original survey |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Numeric |  |
| AA2 | Name |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Text |  |
| AA3 | Last name |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Text |  |
| AA4 | Firm name |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Text |  |
| AA5 | Original interviewer ID |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Numeric |  |
| AA6 | Date of original interview |  |  | Import date |
|  |  |  | Numeric |  |
| AA7 | Backchecker ID |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Numeric |  |

## Dissemination of results

Respondents might request to see the results of the baseline study. In this situation, the subcontractor should inform the respondent that we are happy to share a summary of the results. Nonetheless, we do not wish to do so during data collection, as we do not want to influence answers. Interested respondents should provide email addresses or WhatsApp numbers to the subcontractor. After data collection is completed, the subcontractor (cc’ing SI) should provide them with a summary of the survey that has been prepared via email or WhatsApp and a [link](https://data.mcc.gov/evaluations/index.php/catalog/110/download/1188) to the full public report in English.

The subcontractor should maintain a spreadsheet where it collects the emails or WhatsApp numbers of these respondents along with names. This should be noted in biweekly reporting. Interested respondents should confirm that the email address provided is correct after it has been recorded by the subcontractor to avoid errors.

## Frequently asked questions and suggested responses

1. ***Is this survey really confidential and what does that mean exactly?***

Confidential means that no one outside the research team and SI know how individuals or firms answer the questions. To ensure this, the data are stored on secure servers and reports only include aggregated information (such as 60% of survey respondents agree with a certain statement). In addition, enumerators like myself sign an agreement that we will not disclose information that we hear in interviews.

1. ***Why do you have to interview the same people? I already participated.***

For this type of study, it is important to interview the same people. To illustrate, say that 60% of respondents agreed with a statement at baseline. Now we want to see if the percentage goes up or goes down after two years. If we survey different people, however, we won’t know if any differences are because of changes over time or because we are just talking to different people.

1. ***Who is doing this survey?***

The data collection is being done by a XXXX in collaboration with a US based firm called Social Impact. Social Impact was contracted by the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC), which is a US government development aid organization that provides support to countries like Malawi, to evaluate MCC’s work in Malawi.

1. ***What is the role of the government or ESCOM in the survey?***

The government of Malawi and ESCOM are not directly involved in the survey design, data collection, or data analysis; however, the government and ESCOM fully support the survey and will use the findings.

1. ***Can government institutions or others see how I answer?***

No. Only XXX and SI have access to information linking answers with survey respondents. What the government or others will be able to see are aggregated results, for example the percentage of people that agreed with a certain statement.

1. ***How will the survey be used?***

The primary goal of the survey is to evaluate the Millennium Challenge Corporation’s Compact in Malawi. MCC is a US government development aid organization that provides support to countries like Malawi. So the primary user is MCC. However, the summary results are also shared with ESCOM, the government of Malawi, and will be presented publicly and made publicly available online.

1. ***Can I see the results of this survey or the previous survey?***

Yes. The baseline survey was conducted in 2015 and 2016 and the results were made public last year. We aren’t disseminating the results of the study as we conduct the survey because we don’t want previous responses to influence current responses. However, at the conclusion of data collection, we will be happy to share a summary of the survey and a link to the full report with any participants who are interested and can provide an email address or WhatsApp number. Please provide me with an email address or WhatsApp number and I can ensure that this is sent to you. (Be sure to confirm the spelling of the email address).

(Add as needed)

1. Includes names, addresses, telephone numbers, birthdates, government-issued ID numbers, GPS coordinates, recorded voices, and several others. See more examples in SI’s IRB/Resources folder in SharePoint. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)